



**Toronto Transit Commission**  
1900 Yonge Street, Toronto, ON M4S 1Z2  
416-393-4000

April 10, 2024

Chrisanne Finnerty, Director – Commission Services  
Toronto Transit Commission  
1900 Yonge Street, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Toronto, ON M4S 1Z2

Dear Ms. Finnerty

**Re: Administrative Inquiry on the missing video archive of the February 22, 2024  
Toronto Commission Board Meeting**

Commissioner Moise submitted an Administrative Inquiry to seek clarity and information on the improper storage of the electronic record of the TTC Board Meeting held on February 22, 2024.

This letter provides a response to this request. It has been developed in collaboration with Commission Services.

Introduction

On the morning of Friday, February 23, TTC staff became aware that the archived video feed from the February 22, 2024, TTC Board meeting was unavailable on YouTube. Upon learning that the video was unavailable, our investigation determined that the video stream had not been stopped. Typically, staff ends the stream in the back end of YouTube when the meeting adjourns; in this situation, the feed continued running live for a total run time of 22:18:46 before ending.

TTC staff contacted YouTube and discovered that there appears to be no archived video.

Typically, the TTC can secure a backup copy of the video feed from the City's Broadcast Team; however, they are also unable to restore the video.

Response

Please find below responses to each of the questions submitted.

*1. What are the current procedures regarding the storage of TTC Board Meeting recordings?*

Live broadcasts of TTC Board meetings are archived on the TTC Official YouTube Channel under the Playlists tab. Commission Services, Corporate Communications, and City Broadcast work in tandem to record and livestream TTC Board meetings, an initiative that began in late 2015.

---

Jamaal Myers, Chair  
Joanne De Laurentiis, Vice-Chair  
Richard J. Leary, Chief Executive Officer

Paul Ainslie, Commissioner  
Stephen Holyday, Commissioner  
Fenton Jagdeo, Commissioner  
Josh Matlow, Commissioner

Chris Moise, Commissioner  
Julie Osborne, Commissioner  
Dianne Saxe, Commissioner



2. *Why didn't TTC staff end the YouTube video stream after the meeting adjourned?*

Unfortunately, the video stream of the February 22, 2024 TTC Board meeting was not properly archived on YouTube due to TTC staff not physically ending the live stream on YouTube as is regular practice. It was human error not to end the stream immediately after adjourning and staff regret the error.

3. *What is the role of the City of Toronto's Broadcast Team in board meetings and why weren't they able to provide a backup copy?*

The City of Toronto's Broadcast Team provides the live webcast of TTC Board Meetings. This means that they are responsible for sending video from the meeting room to the TTC's YouTube channel. In addition, the Broadcast Team provides audio-visual support during the meeting through managing microphones and switching video feeds, for example.

The TTC has received video recordings from the Broadcast Team previously, however, our understanding is that they do not have a video record of the February 22 meeting. We are unclear of the reason why.

4. *What did YouTube communicate when TTC staff requested a copy of the archived video?*

When TTC staff became aware the broadcast of the February 22 meeting was not available on the TTC Official YouTube Channel the morning after the meeting, staff contacted YouTube Studio representative via live chat for assistance and it was confirmed that the broadcast could not be recovered as the live stream had run past the maximum 12 hours for it to be auto-archived. The TTC followed up with YouTube management and they further confirmed

*"If your live stream is less than 12 hours, YouTube can automatically archive it for you. This option applies to all types of live streams - including: encoder, webcam, and mobile. YouTube will also automatically archive streams of 1440p and 2160p (4K) video resolution. But we recommend also recording a local archive as a backup. You can create [highlight clips](#) while your stream is still live.*

***Note: If your stream exceeds 12 hours, it may not be captured at all.***

5. *What steps were or are being taken to recover the recording?*

TTC staff contacted YouTube representatives on three separate occasions, February 23, February 26 and March 11, in an effort to recover the broadcast. On each occasion, YouTube reconfirmed the broadcast was no longer available or possible to retrieve.



6. *What steps are being taken to prevent a future recurrence of this issue?*

Redundancies have been built into the system going forward that includes recording the WebEx meeting, and requesting a copy of the video record from the City's Broadcast Team on meeting day.

In situations where a Board meeting is anticipated to exceed 12 hours, TTC Staff will create two video streams, in an effort to avoid reaching the YouTube archival limit.

Sincerely,

Natalie Poole-Moffatt  
Chief Corporate Affairs Officer

cc:  
Richard J. Leary, Chief Executive Officer